

AMERICAN MATHEMATICAL SOCIETY

COUNCIL MINUTES

Washington, DC
17 April 1993

November 21, 1995

Abstract

The Council of the American Mathematical Society met at 7:00 pm on Saturday, 17 April 1993, in the Langston Room at the Howard University Inn, located at 2225 Georgia Avenue, N.W., Washington, DC, on the Howard University Campus. Members present were: Salah Baouendi, Joan Birman, Ruth Charney, Carl Cowen, David Cox, Chandler Davis, Robert Fossum, Frank Gilfeather, Ron Graham, Judy Green, Rebecca Herb, Svetlana Katok, Steven Krantz, James Lepowsky, Peter Li, Elliott Lieb, Anil Nerode, Richard Palais (representing the Bulletin Editorial Committee), Franklin Peterson, Wilfried Schmid, Lesley Sibner (Associate Secretary with vote), B.A. Taylor, Steven Weintraub, and Susan Williams.

Also present were Hyman Bass (speaking for the Committee on Science Policy), Spud Bradley (AED), Monica Foulkes (Assistant to AED), William Jaco (ED), D. J. Lewis (chair of Committee on Professional Ethics), Alice Schafer (Chair of Committee on Human Rights), and Kelly Young (Assistant to the Secretary).

President Graham presided.

Contents

0	Call to Order and Introductions.	4
0.1	Call to Order.	4
0.2	Introduction of New Council Members.	4
1	MINUTES	4
1.1	January 93 Council.	4
1.2	Election to the Executive Committee.	4
2	CONSENT AGENDA.	4
2.1	Discharge Committees.	5
2.1.1	Screen Applicants from PRC	5
2.1.2	Special Subcommittee to Study the Committee Structure.	5
2.1.3	Service to Mathematicians in Developing Countries.	5
2.2	New Mathematical Society	5
2.3	Hellenic Mathematical Society.	5
3	REPORTS OF BOARDS AND STANDING COMMITTEES.	6
3.1	EBC	6
3.1.1	Colloquium Editorial Committee.	6
3.1.2	Mathematical Surveys and Monographs.	6
3.1.3	Mathematical Reviews Editorial Committee.	6
3.1.4	Proceedings Editorial Committee.	6
3.2	NOMINATING COMMITTEE	6
3.2.1	President-Elect:	6
3.2.2	Trustee:	7
3.2.3	Vice-President:	7
3.2.4	Member-at-Large of the Council:	7
3.2.5	Eligibility for election.	8
3.3	Executive Committee and Board of Trustees (ECBT).	8
3.4	Report from the Executive Director.	8
3.5	Report from AMS Representative to Canadian Mathematical Society.	8
4	REPORTS OF SPECIAL COMMITTEES.	8
4.1	Guidelines for COPE	8
4.2	Special Committee on Meetings of the Council.	9
4.3	Special Committee on Ethical Conduct	10
5	UNFINISHED BUSINESS.	10
6	NEW BUSINESS	10
6.1	Mathematical Conference in Cuba.	10
6.2	Amendments to the Bylaws.	11
6.3	Research Announcements.	13

<i>CONTENTS</i>	3
7 ANNOUNCEMENTS, INFORMATION, AND RECORD.	13
7.1 Future Meetings	13
7.2 Copyright Policy	13
8 ADJOURNMENT.	13
A Attachments: INTRODUCTIONS.	14
A.1 1993 Council.	14
B Attachments: MINUTES	15
B.1 Attachments: Election to the Executive Committee.	15
B.2 Special Committee on Professional Conduct	16
C Attachments: ANNOUNCEMENTS, INFORMATION, AND RECORD	20
C.1 Future Meetings.	20

0 Call to Order and Introductions.

0.1 Call to Order.

President Graham opened the meeting at 7:08 PM by introducing the Council.

0.2 Introduction of New Council Members.

Newly elected or appointed members of the Council took office on 01 February 1993 and they are:

Vice-President:	Anil Nerode
Members-at-Large:	Svetlana R. Katok
	Steven Krantz
	Peter Li
	James I. Lepowsky
	Susan Gayle Williams

Representatives of Committees

Bulletin Editorial Committee	Murray Protter, Chair
Mathematical Reviews Editorial Committee	Philip J. Hanlon, Chair

A complete list of the 1993 Council is attached (Attachment A.1).

1 MINUTES

1.1 January 93 Council.

The Minutes of the January 93 Council were approved.

1.2 Election to the Executive Committee.

The Council conducted an election for a member to serve on the Executive Committee (EC). Member-at-Large John Franks was elected to a four year term on the EC. The attached minute was approved (see Attachment B.1).

2 CONSENT AGENDA.

Items appearing on the Consent Agenda will be considered approved unless brought to the floor for discussion. In which case they must be approved in the usual manner.¹

¹An item in the Consent Agenda is considered approved unless the Council agrees to discussion of the item. (Items on the Consent Agenda for the Executive Committee may be brought to the floor for discussion by two members of the committee.) According to Sturgis *Standard Code of Parliamentary Procedure*, which governs meetings of the Council, "Any member has a right to remove any item from the consent agenda so that it may be considered and voted on separately. The remaining items are then unanimously approved *en bloc* without discussion"

2.1 Discharge Committees.

2.1.1 AMS-SIAM Committee to Screen Applicants for Graduate Study from the People's Republic of China.

The work of this committee, to screen applicants from China for graduate study in the United States, is over. The committee has not met in several years and has no plans to do so in the future. This committee was discharged with thanks.

2.1.2 Special Subcommittee to Study the Committee Structure.

This committee completed its charge by reporting to the January 1993 and was discharged with thanks.

2.1.3 Service to Mathematicians in Developing Countries.

The January 1993 Council approved the establishment of a standing Committee on International Affairs. In approving this committee, the Council also recommended that the various committees that have been established to carry out portions of our international communications should be discharged. Accordingly the Committee on Service to Mathematicians in Developing Countries was discharged with thanks.

2.2 New Mathematical Society

[This item was moved out of the Consent agenda to New Business where it was discussed.]

The newly formed Palestine Society of Mathematical Sciences will hold its first general meeting 16-19 June 1993 in Jerusalem and Ramallah. International participation is invited. It was moved, seconded and passed to send the following greetings:

The Council of the American Mathematical Society welcomes the formation of the Palestine Society of Mathematical Sciences and extends congratulations to its inaugural meeting. It hopes for many years of fruitful cooperation between the societies in the furtherance of mathematical research, education, and scientific exchange.

2.3 Hellenic Mathematical Society.

The Hellenic Mathematical Society is celebrating the 75th anniversary of its founding this year. It has invited a representative of the Society to attend one of its scientific meetings during this year. On the occasion of this special year, the Council approved the following greetings:

The Council of the American Mathematical Society congratulates the Hellenic Mathematical Society on the occasion of the completion of seventy-five years of active scientific contributions to the international and Hellenic mathematical communities.

The Council looks forward to cooperating with the Hellenic Mathematical Society in continuing efforts to attain common goals within the mathematical sciences.

3 REPORTS OF BOARDS AND STANDING COMMITTEES.

3.1 EDITORIAL BOARDS COMMITTEE (EBC). [EXECUTIVE SESSION]

The Editorial Boards Committee recommended appointments of several editors. These appointments were considered in Executive Session, approved by the Council, and are as follows:

3.1.1 Colloquium Editorial Committee.

The appointment of WILLIAM BROWDER to a regular three year term on the Colloquium Editorial Committee, with term beginning upon appointment and ending on 31 January 1996. (Browder replaces Keisler, whose term expired.)

3.1.2 Mathematical Surveys and Monographs.

The reappointment of ROBERT GREENE to a three year term.

3.1.3 Mathematical Reviews Editorial Committee.

The appointment of J.-L. LODAY (U Strasbourg, France) as an extra member until 31 January 1994, then to replace Weinberger as a regular member for a three year term beginning 01 February 1994.

3.1.4 Proceedings Editorial Committee.

The appointment of LINDA KEEN as Coordinating Editor for ODE, PDE, Global Analysis, Dynamical Systems with term starting 01 February 1994 (to replace B. Keyfitz).

3.2 NOMINATING COMMITTEE

The Nominating Committee recommended nominations of candidates for election in the 1993 Election. These were considered in Executive Session, approved by the Council, and are as follows:

3.2.1 President-Elect:

The individual elected to the position of President-Elect serves for one year in that position (in this instance from 01 February 1994 until 31 January 1995), then two years as President, and then a year as Ex-President. The Nominating Committee has been asked by the Council to nominate two candidates for election to this position. In addition, the Council has requested that the Nominating Committee recommend a Nominator for each candidate. The duty of the Nominator is to write an article about the candidate for publication in the Notices.

The Nominating Committee recommended

CATHLEEN MORAWETZ, New York University, with ANDREW MAJDA as Nominator, and

HYMAN BASS, Columbia University, with John W. MILNOR as Nominator.

as candidates for election to the position of President-Elect.

3.2.2 Trustee:

The Nominating Committee recommended the nomination of

DON LEWIS, Michigan, and
MARC RIEFFEL, University of California, Berkeley,

for election to one position as Trustee for a term of five years beginning on 01 February 1994.

3.2.3 Vice-President:

The Nominating Committee recommended the nomination of

JERRY BONA, Penn State University, and
RAMESH GANGOLLI, University of Washington-Seattle,

for election to one position as Vice-President for a term of three years commencing on 01 February 1994.

In addition, the Secretary had received the requisite number of valid signatures from members and the agreement of the candidate to recommend the nomination of

JEAN TAYLOR, Rutgers University,

for election to the same position.

3.2.4 Member-at-Large of the Council:

The Nominating Committee recommended the nomination of

EDWARD BIERSTONE, University of Toronto,
JAMES W. CANNON, Brigham Young University,
DENNIS DETURCK, University of Pennsylvania,
ROBERT K. LAZARFELD, UCLA
FRANK MORGAN, Williams College,
JILL C. PIPHER, Brown University,
DONALD St. P. RICHARDS, University of Virginia,
NORBERTO SALINAS, University of Kansas,
SYLVIA WIEGAND, University of Nebraska, and
ROBERT J. ZIMMER, University of Chicago

for election to five positions as Member-at-Large of the Council for a term of three years beginning on 01 February 1994. (There were no petitions suggesting nomination to this position.)

All nominations were approved by the Council.

3.2.5 Eligibility for election.

During its deliberations and searches for candidates for the upcoming elections, the Nominating Committee considered possible candidates who do not reside in North America. Rather than confront the issue of nominating such candidates by actually doing so, the Nominating Committee decided to put the question to the Council. It asked the Council to instruct the Nominating Committee on the question as to whether the Council will consider nominations for election of members of the Society who do not reside in North America.

It was moved and seconded to send to the Nominating Committee the following statement:

Any member in good standing of the Society is eligible for candidacy and election to office or for membership on committees of the Society. In particular, residence in North America is not a prerequisite for candidacy for nomination for an office in the Society or for membership on committees of the Society.

An amendment to revise the resolution to add

In all cases, the Nominating Committee will obtain assurances that candidates nominated will agree to serve if elected.

was defeated. The resolution then passed.

3.3 Executive Committee and Board of Trustees (ECBT).

Neither the Executive Committee nor the Board of Trustees had met since the last meeting of the Council and so there was no business to report.

3.4 Report from the Executive Director.

The Executive Director, William H. Jaco, gave his annual report to the Council.

3.5 Report from AMS Representative to Canadian Mathematical Society.

Vice-President Davis, the official representative from the AMS to the CMS, has filed a report which is filed in the AMS Committee Report Book for 1993, Report No. 930617-01.

4 REPORTS OF SPECIAL COMMITTEES.

4.1 Special Committee on Guidelines and Procedures for the Committee on Professional Ethics.

The guidelines and procedures were adopted by the January 1993 Council subject to review by Society counsel. The Council determined that those part of the procedures concerning election of members to the Committee on Professional Ethics will apply immediately to future committees. The comments will be returned to the special Committee on Guidelines and Procedures for a report to a future Council.

4.2 Special Committee on Meetings of the Council.

A special committee had been appointed early in 1993 to consider when the Council should meet. The committee consisted of Joan Birman, Robert Fossum, Frank Peterson, and Steve Weintraub. The committee considered several questions.

- What portion of a Council member's travel and subsistence should be reimbursed by the Society?
- Should there be any kind of restriction on types of airfares that are reimbursed?
- When and where should the Council meet in January?
- When and where should the Council meet in the Spring?
- When and where should the Council meet in the late summer?
- When should the Council meet at the meeting in Vancouver?

Following a report of the committee and some discussion, the Council adopted the following recommendations:

Reimbursements: As a temporary policy, in effect until the Society adopts a general reimbursement policy, members attending Council meetings should be reimbursed for airfares not exceeding supersaver fares, not more than \$75 for ground transportation, and one night lodging. Exceptions can be made by requesting approval from the Secretary prior to the travel.

All efforts will be made to schedule meetings so that supersaver fares can be used. Reference to supersaver fares will be continued as long as they exist.

Spring Meetings of the Council. Meetings of the Council in the Spring should be held on a Saturday beginning in the afternoon. If the agenda cannot be completed before early evening, the meeting should continue on Sunday morning. In the event that there is not a convenient sectional meeting near a transportation center, then this Spring Council meeting should be held at or near an airline hub so that members can conveniently arrive at and depart from the meeting.

Meeting in Vancouver, BC. The Council will meet on Saturday 14 August 1993 beginning at 1:00 pm.

Meeting in Minneapolis in August 1994. The Council is scheduled to meet on Sunday, 14 August 1994, from 1:00 PM until the evening, with supper included.

Meeting in Cincinnati (and other Annual Meetings): The Council will meet on Tuesday, 11 January 1994, beginning at 1:00 PM, in Cincinnati, Ohio.

Meetings at other Annual Meetings: The Council will meet on a day of the weekend of an Annual Meeting that is nearest to the first or last day of the meeting. (Under the current schedule, the Council would meet on a Saturday.)

4.3 Special Committee on Ethical Conduct

A special committee consisting of Chandler Davis, Chair, Lee D. Mosher, and Frank S. Quinn was appointed by then President Artin to make findings and recommendations to the Council on the complaint of Richard K. Skora. The final report of this committee is attached (see Attachment B.2, a copy of which is on file in the AMS Committee Report Book for 1993, Report No. 930615-01,). Chair Davis presented the report. The Council accepted the report with thanks and requested that the Secretary publish the report in the Notices and send copies to the Principals along with the minutes of this Council.

The committee was discharged with thanks.

5 UNFINISHED BUSINESS.

There was no unfinished business.

6 NEW BUSINESS

6.1 Mathematical Conference in Cuba.

The Second International Conference on Approximation and Optimization is being held in Havana, Cuba, in the period 26 September to 01 October 1993. The Council endorsed the following resolution (without dissent).

The Council of the AMS, in accordance with its established practice of supporting the free circulation of scientists, calls upon the US Administration to permit all US mathematicians wishing to participate in the “Second International Conference on Approximation and Optimization” (Havana, Cuba, September 26-October 1, 1993) to do so and to authorize them to participate in the same fashion as would be normal were the conference to be held in another country. This includes their right to attend without being “fully hosted”.

The Society officers are to approach promptly the appropriate officers of the US State and Treasury Departments (the agencies administering the present US government policy) and to secure the support of the Science Advisor to President Clinton.

These officials, in addition to being made aware of the general issues involved should be informed that this Conference is sponsored by the Third World Academy of Sciences and by the International Mathematical Union. The US is represented in the IMU and in it supports the policy of free circulation of scientists. Further, a blanket licence to attend should be sought without requiring individuals to apply one by one for permission.

These amendments to the Bylaws were moved and seconded. It was moved, seconded and passed to substitute these amendments with the following amendments:

Article III, Committees Section 1. There shall be nine editorial committees as follows: committees for the *Bulletin*, for the *Proceedings*, for the *Colloquium Publications*, for the *Journal*, for *Mathematical Surveys and Monographs*, for *Mathematical Reviews*; a joint committee for the *Transactions* and the *Memoirs*; a committee consisting of the representatives of the Society on the Board of Editors of the *American Journal of Mathematics*; and a committee for *Mathematics of Computation*.

Séctiôn / 2 // Théré / sháll / bē / á / Scíénçé / Pólícý / Cómmité / e /

Séctiôn / 3 // Théré / sháll / bē / á / cómúnícátións / cómmité / e / cálléd / thē / Cómmité / tó / Mónítór / Próblém / s / ín / Cómúnícátión /

Section 2. The size of each committee shall be determined by the Council.

Article IV, Council Section 1. The Council shall consist of fifteen members-at-large and the following *ex officio* members: the officers of the Society specified in Article I, except that it shall include only one associate secretary, the chairman of each of the editorial committees specified in Article III *á n d / ó f / thē / cómúnícátión / s / cómmité / á n d / ó f / thē / Scíénçé / Pólícý / Cómmité*, any former secretary for a period of two years following the terms of office, and members of the Executive Committee (Article V) who remain on the Council by the operation of Article VII, Section 4.

Article VI, Executive Director Section 3. The Executive Director shall work under the immediate direction of a committee consisting of the president, the secretary, and the treasurer, of which the president shall be chairman *ex officio*. The Executive Director shall attend meetings of the Board of Trustees, the Council, and the Executive Committee, but shall not be a member of any of these bodies. *Thē // Éxécutív // Diréctór // sháll // bē / á / vóthíng / mémbér // óf // thē / Cómmit / té / tó // Mónítór // Próblém / s / ín // Cómúnícátión / bú / t // sháll / nót // bē // í / t / s / cháír / mán /*

Article VII, Section 2. Each committee named in Article III */ / Séctiôn / 1 / óf / 3 /* shall be appointed by the Council in a manner designated by the Council.

Ártíclé / XI // Cómúnícátións Thē / Cómmité / tó / Mónítór / Próblém / s / ín / Cómúnícátión / sháll / pérfór / m / súc / h / tásks // ín / thē / fíéld / óf / cómúnícátión / óf / máthémátícs / ás / á / t / é / ás / sígnéd / tó / í / t / bý / thē / Cón / cíl /

(Article XII will be deleted and the remaining articles numbered accordingly.)

These amendments were approved and forwarded to the members in the 1993 election for approval by the membership.

6.3 Research Announcements.

Frank Quinn submitted the resolution below for discussion and action.

The Research Announcements section of the Bulletin will be discontinued. A new section entitled “Research News” will be initiated, located in the Notices pending the reorganization of Membership Publications by CRMP. This section is to be reader-oriented, and written by “mathematical journalists” not directly involved in the research. The objective is to communicate new research broadly to the membership, to promote a content-based sense of community among mathematicians, and promote an awareness of the vitality and diversity of mathematical research.

This resolution was tabled.

7 ANNOUNCEMENTS, INFORMATION, AND RECORD.

7.1 Future Meetings

See the listing in Attachment C.1

7.2 Copyright Policy

This issue was to be considered by this Council. The chair of the Board of Trustees, John Polking, appointed a committee of the BT to consider the matter. Paul Sally was appointed chair of that committee. Shortly after the committee was appointed, Sally resigned because of health problems. Andrew Odlyzko has been appointed chair of this committee.

8 ADJOURNMENT.

The Council adjourned at about 11:10 PM.

Respectfully submitted:
Robert Fossum
Urbana, Illinois

A Attachments: INTRODUCTIONS.

A.1 1993 Council.

AMERICAN MATHEMATICAL SOCIETY

effective 2/01/93

1993 COUNCIL

President	Ronald L. Graham	Secretary	Robert M. Fossum
Ex-President	Michael Artin	Associate Secretaries	Robert Daverman
Vice Presidents	Chandler Davis		Andy Roy Magid
	Linda Keen		Lesley Sibner
	Anil Nerode		Lance W. Small
Treasurer	F. P. Peterson	Associate Treasurer	B. A. Taylor

Representatives of Committees

Bulletin Editorial Committee	Murray Protter, Chair
Colloquium Editorial Committee	G. D. Mostow, Chair
Committee to Monitor Problems in Communications	Judy Green, Chair
Journal of the American Mathematical Society	Wilfried Schmid, Chair
Mathematical Reviews Editorial Committee	Philip J. Hanlon, Chair
Mathematical Surveys Editorial Committee	Marc A. Rieffel, Chair
Mathematics of Computation Committee	Walter Gautschi, Chair
Proceedings Editorial Committee	Irwin Kra, Chair
Representative on American Journal	M. Salah Baouendi
Science Policy Committee	Frank W. Warner III, Chair
Transactions and Memoirs Committee	James E. Baumgartner, Chair
Executive Committee	Joan Birman
Executive Committee	Arthur Jaffe

Members at Large

Ruth M. Charney	Carl C. Cowen, Jr.	David A. Cox
John M. Franks	Frank Gilfeather	Rebecca A. Herb
Svetlana R. Katok	Steven Krantz	Peter Li
Elliott H. Lieb	James K. Lepowsky	Gunther A. Uhlmann
Steven H. Weintraub	Ruth J. Williams	Susan Gayle Williams

Trustees

Roy Adler	Ronald Graham	Maria M. Klawe
M. Susan Montgomery	F.P. Peterson	John C. Polking
Paul Sally, Jr.	B.A. Taylor	

Executive Committee

Michael Artin	M. Salah Baouendi	Joan Birman
Robert M. Fossum	John M. Franks	Ronald Graham
	Arthur Jaffe	

B Attachments: MINUTES

B.1 Attachments: Election to the Executive Committee.

AMERICAN MATHEMATICAL SOCIETY

COUNCIL

BUSINESS BY MAIL

07 April 1993

Robert Fossum

The Council conducted its annual election of a member to the Executive Committee. Members Ronald L. Graham, Chandler Davis, Linda Keen, Franklin Peterson, B. A. Taylor, Robert Fossum, Judy Green, Marc A. Rieffel, Walter Gautschi, Salah Baouendi, Frank W. Warner, Joan Birman, Ruth M. Charney, Carl C. Cowen, Jr. David A. Cox, John M. Franks, Rebecca A. Herb, Svetlana R. Katok, Steven Krantz, James I. Lepowsky, Peter Li, Elliott H. Lieb, Gunther A. Uhlmann, Ruth J. Williams, and Susan Gayle Williams, returned valid ballots. There were three ballots returned in unsigned envelopes and one returned ballot was invalid.

An *ad hoc* nominating committee appointed by President Graham, consisting of Alice Chang and Hugo Rossi, considered the replies to the inquiries concerning willingness to stand for election and suggestions for candidates from the members of the 1993 Council. It submitted the following report:

The committee nominates Council members CARL C. COWEN and JOHN M. FRANKS as candidates for election by the Council to the Executive Committee for a term of four years.

There were seven votes (7) for Carl Cowen and seventeen (17) votes for John Franks. There was one abstention. Therefore John Franks is declared the winner and is elected to a four year term as a member of the Council's Executive Committee. His term begins on 01 February and ends when a replacement is elected in March 1997.

B.2 Special Committee on Professional Conduct

April 1993

Report on the Skora-Sundheim Controversy

Introduction

This Committee was instructed to make findings and recommendations to Council on the complaint of Richard K. Skora. We have spoken with Dr Skora, Dr Paul A. Sundheim, Professor Cameron M. Gordon, and others involved in the dispute. We have studied all the mathematical papers in question, including unpublished preprints; we have read the files provided by the AMS's Committee on Professional Ethics and the Inquiry Report prepared at the University of Texas.

History of the Case

This report can be brief because we require no difficult weighing of conflicting testimony. The issues as we see them can be resolved using facts on which all parties now agree.

The dispute concerns the thesis and subsequent papers of Paul Sundheim, who was a student of Cameron Gordon at the University of Texas. The subject of his thesis had been studied earlier by Richard Skora, and it is this overlap that is at issue. Specifically, we are called on to judge whether Sundheim's thesis and papers gave inadequate recognition of Skora's priority.

Knots and links are 1-manifolds regarded as imbedded in 3-manifolds; i.e., two of them are equivalent if one can be obtained from the other by an isotopy of the containing 3-manifold. In the classical theory, the 3-manifold is S^3 . In 1986 or 1987, Skora embarked on the extension of some central classical results to knots imbedded in general 3-manifolds. Gordon, unaware of this, suggested the same area of research to Sundheim, who had passed his qualifying examination in August 1987.

The first of these classical results is Markov's Theorem. Links in the 3-sphere are all obtainable up to isotopy as closed braids (Alexander's Theorem). Markov's Theorem tells when two closed braids are isotopic: one must be obtainable from the other by "Markov moves," a small inventory of special transformations. The reference given for a full development of this theory is Joan Birman, *Braids, Links and Mapping Class Groups*, 1974. Skora gave the generalization in a preprint which was circulated in October 1988, and in particular was sent to Gordon and Sundheim. Skora's proof imitates that in Birman's book, and the conclusion is a generalization of Markov's; the main complication is that one does not –can not– begin the definition of a braid by reference to an unknotted closed curve.

The second of the classical results is Reidemeister's Theorem. This tells how to recognize any equivalence between two links in S^3 in a standard way from their "diagrams" –the pattern of over- and under-crossings they yield following a projection (of R^3) to a disk. A small inventory of "Reidemeister moves," particular transformations of diagrams, is specified, and the theorem states that two links are equivalent if and only if the diagram of one can be taken to the diagram of the other by a sequence of Reidemeister moves. Skora gave the generalization in a preprint which was circulated in December 1988, in particular to Gordon and Sundheim. The definition of diagram is not so straightforward as in the classical case, but uses ideas which have been around for many

years. The result differs from the classical result: a new Reidemeister move must be introduced. The classical Reidemeister moves involve local changes in the diagram; the new move is not capable of localization.

Sundheim had begun work on these matters before receiving the preprints. His generalization of the Markov Theorem appeared in preprint form in October 1989; of the Reidemeister Theorem, in April 1989, revised in January 1990. His thesis was approved in May 1990.

Both authors have had manuscripts rejected or returned for revision on these subjects. However, Skora's "Closed braids in 3- manifolds," on his generalized Markov Theorem, is forthcoming in *Math. Zeitschrift*; Skora's "Knot and link projections in 3- manifolds," on his generalized Reidemeister theorem (final revision May 1990) appeared in *Math. Zeitschrift* 206 (1990), 345-350; Sundheim's "The Alexander and Markov Theorems via diagrams for links in closed orientable 3-manifolds" is forthcoming in *Trans. Amer. Math. Soc.*; and Sundheim's "Reidemeister's theorem for 3- manifolds" (final revision May 1990) appeared in *Math. Proc. Camb. Phil. Soc.* 110 (1991), 281-292. We found no significant divergences between Sundheim's thesis and the papers based on it, or for that matter between early and late versions of the papers of either author.

In 1989 and 1990, Skora several times pointed out privately to Gordon that Sundheim's presentation of these results required acknowledgement of Skora's priority. Beginning in January 1991, Skora complained formally to the University of Texas and the American Mathematical Society that Sundheim was incorrectly representing the two theorems as new work whereas he had learned them from Skora's preprints. The Society's Committee on Professional Ethics submitted a report in September 1991, recommending "that it be suggested to Sundheim that in the interests of amity he make a stronger statement giving priority to Skora, even though he has already given Skora proper credit." Indeed, Sundheim and Gordon declared to COPE their willingness to acknowledge Skora's priority. (This aspect is examined in detail below.) However, Skora was dissatisfied with the implication he saw in COPE's wording that the "stronger statement giving priority" was needed only to assuage his hurt feelings; he complained vigorously both to the Society and to the University of Texas. The present report is the outcome of the Society's reconsideration of the matter. Meanwhile, the University conducted interviews and assembled a lengthy report, which remains confidential but which we were permitted to read. This report, on behalf of the Department of Mathematics and the Graduate School, concluded that "the charges against Dr. Cameron M. Gordon and his student, Dr. Paul Arnold Sundheim are without foundation."

As we stated at the outset, there are no substantive disagreements remaining about the facts. What makes the clash seem sharp is that the word "plagiarism" has been used by Skora and some sympathizers. But this word in common language means "taking another's ideas and presenting them as one's own," so that applied to Sundheim it sounds like an accusation that he presented in his thesis and papers proofs he had copied from Skora, in the guise of new proofs of his own. This accusation could not be sustained. Letters by Dr Skora and Professor Gordon since 1991 have agreed in stipulating that Sundheim's proofs were different, though there may be disagreement on how essential their novelty was.

Sundheim's proof of the generalized Markov Theorem uses a technique of H.R. Morton called threading of a diagram, mentioned but bypassed in Skora's paper. Morton's paper was on Sundheim's reading list before he heard of Skora's work, and he was probably committed to this line of proof. Sundheim's new Reidemeister move is somewhat different from Skora's, a simplification which streamlines Skora's proof is not used in his, and the induction on which he relies has no counterpart in Skora's proof.

In short, there is no indication that Sundheim was influenced by the 1988 preprints, or even that he read them. He did know they existed; they were available to him, and he acknowledges that they were. He had the reinforcement of knowing the results were true, but he set out to find for himself why they were. He could have presented his thesis as new proofs of theorems of Skora; whether its novelty is sufficient to give his work interest is a question for his thesis committee and the editors receiving his papers, not for this Committee. When one presents a new proof of a known result, one may enhance the value of the exposition to the reader by commenting on the differences from the predecessor's approach, and Sundheim did not do this; the question of whether such comment was needed here might be subject to judgement by thesis committee or editors, but is not before this Committee.

The case would be altogether different if Sundheim had essentially proved the theorems before Gordon and he received the Skora proofs. He had done some work. To assess it at this late date is perhaps impossible. What we can say (and it is sufficient basis for excluding this 1988 work from our considerations) is that by Sundheim's own account it did not comprise publicly presentable proofs and it had not been communicated to Gordon or anyone else.

There remains the matter of attribution. The Sundheim thesis, May 1990, says

Similar results have been independently discovered by Richard Skora using other methods

and refers to Skora's 1988 preprints without giving any date for them. Sundheim's paper in Proc. Camb. Phil. Soc. says

This result was also obtained previously and independently by Richard Skora

and refers to the appropriate preprint giving the wrong date: 1991 instead of 1988 (though this paper's final revision is said to have been received also in May 1990).

Skora's papers and preprints do not mention Sundheim. The obligation was evidently less in this direction; still, it is normal practice in such a case to refer to other treatments.

Conclusions

We concur with the formulation of the AMS Committee, 13 September 1991, that by that date the only difference between the parties was that Sundheim

claims a higher level of independence of his work than Skora would allow him, though he cedes the priority to Skora.

We concur also that a proper form of citation would have been the following, cited by that report and agreeable to both parties:

A generalization of the Markov [resp. Rademacher] Theorem was proved first by Richard Skora [...] (1988). Here we give a different proof [...].

More remains to be said.

To give an accurate report of the sources and publication of an idea is the responsibility of the author of a public scholarly paper. The potential damage from the inadequacy of Sundheim's report was small, but the responsibility was there; it was incumbent on Professor Gordon as thesis

director to make this responsibility clear to Sundheim and to ensure that it was discharged in the official version of the thesis as accepted by the University.

We are aware that lapses of this sort, even more serious ones, often occur, and are often ignored. This particular incident came to wide public attention only because Skora's doggedness and at times his overstatements kept it salient.

The responsibility to tell a reasonably accurate life story of a theorem serves several purposes. Omitting the story can create the inaccurate impression of independence from previous work, slighting the work done by others. But this responsibility is not just a courtesy to placate rivals. The object is to lay down in the literature a correct record, for the sake of readers. It is therefore a responsibility to the profession, and the Society shares the duty to preserve it.

Committee on Ethical Conduct

Lee D. Mosher
Frank S. Quinn
Chandler Davis (Chair)

C Attachments: ANNOUNCEMENTS, INFORMATION, AND RECORD

C.1 Future Meetings.

Future Meetings

DATE	MEETING	SITE
June 29, 1993	AAUP 48th Annual Meeting	Salt Lake City/ Snowbird, UT
July 10-11, 1993	MSEB Exec Committee Meeting	Washington, DC
July 10-August 6, 1993	Joint Summer Research Conf.	Seattle, WA
July 11-15, 1993	2nd World Congress on Neural Networks (cosponsored by AMS)	Portland, OR
July 11-30, 1993	AMS Summer Institute	Ithaca, NY
July 12-16, 1993	SIAM Annual Meeting	Philadelphia, PA
July 20-23, 1993	CESSE Annual Meeting	Baltimore, MD
August 9-13, 1993	AMS Symposium on Math of Computation	Vancouver, BC, Canada
August 14, 1993	LRPC Meeting	Vancouver, BC, Canada
August 14, 1993	AMS Council (1:00 PM)	Vancouver, BC, Canada
August 15-19, 1993	AMS-MAA-CMS Summer Meeting	Vancouver, BC, Canada
September 17-19, 1993	CSP/COE Meeting	Washington, DC
September 18-19, 1993	AMS Sectional Meeting	Syracuse, NY
September 30, 1993	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
October 1-2, 1993	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
October 1-3, 1993	AMS/DMV Meeting	Heidelberg, Germany
October 15-17, 1993	Second International Conference on Ordinal Data Analysis (cosponsored by AMS)	Amherst, MA
October 15 & 17, 1993	ABC Meeting	Providence, RI
October 16, 1993	LRPC Meeting	Providence, RI
October 21, 1993	MREC Meeting	Ann Arbor, MI
October 22, 1993	JPBM Meeting	Washington, DC
October 22-23, 1993	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Texas A&M Univ.	College Station, TX
October 28-29, 1993	BMS Meeting	Arlington, VA
October 29-30, 1993	BMS Chairs Colloquium	Arlington, VA
November 5-7, 1993	SUMMAC Meeting, MAA	Washington, DC
November 6-7, 1993	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Harvey Mudd College	Claremont, CA
November 19-21, 1993	ECBT	Providence, RI

November 20, 1993	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
December 2-4, 1993	AMS-Sociedad Matematica Mexicana Meeting @ Universidad Autonoma de Yucatan	Yucatan, Mexico
December 5-7, 1993	CSSP Meeting	Washington, DC
January 11, 1994	AMS Council (2:00 PM)	Cincinnati, OH
January 12-15, 1994	AMS-MAA Annual Meeting (AMS's 100th Annual Meeting!)	Cincinnati, OH
January 21, 1994	BMS Executive Committee	Washington, DC
January 26-28, 1994	SLA Winter Meeting	Dallas, TX
January 27, 1994	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
January 28-29, 1994	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
February 5-8, 1994	ALA Midwinter Meeting	Los Angeles, CA
March 4-6, 1994	Southern Univ. Presses Mtg.	Jackson, MS
March 9-12, 1994	CESSE Midwinter Meeting	Bermuda
March 12, 1994	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
March 18-19, 1994	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Univ. of Kentucky	Lexington, KY
March 19-20, 1994	ABC Meeting	Providence, RI
March 25-26, 1994	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Kansas State Univ.	Manhattan, KS
April 9-10, 1994	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Polytechnic Univ.	Brooklyn, NY
April 21-23, 1994	BMS	Washington, DC
May 12, 1994	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
May 13-14, 1994	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
May 20-22, 1994	ECBT Meeting	Ann Arbor, MI
June 11-16, 1994	SLA Annual Conference	Atlanta, GA
June 16-18, 1994	AMS/MAA Sectional Meeting @ Univ. of Oregon	Eugene, OR
June 24-25, 1994	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
July 19-22, 1994	CESSE Annual Meeting	Raleigh, NC
July 25-29, 1994	SIAM Annual Meeting	San Diego, CA
August 3-11, 1994	International Congress of Mathematicians (ICM-94)	Zurich, Switzerland
August 14, 1994	AMS Council (9:00 AM)	Minneapolis, MN

August 15-17, 1994	AMS-MAA Summer Mathfest @ Univ. of Minnesota	Minneapolis, MN
September 29, 1994	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
September 30-		
October 1, 1994	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
October 10-16, 1994 TENT	AMS-MIT Wiener Conference	Cambridge, MA
October 15-16, 1994	ABC Meeting	Providence, RI
October 28-29, 1994	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Oklahoma State Univ.	Stillwater, OK
November 11-13, 1994	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Univ. of Richmond	Richmond, VA
November 18-20, 1994	ECBT Meeting	Providence, RI
November 19, 1994	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
January 4-7, 1995	AMS-MAA Annual Meeting	San Francisco, CA
January 7, 1995	AMS Council Meeting	San Francisco, CA
January 25-27, 1995	SLA Winter Meeting	Raleigh-Durham, NC
January 26, 1995	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
January 27-28, 1995	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
March 4-5, 1995	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Univ. of Connecticut	Hartford, CT
March 11, 1995	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
March 17-18, 1995	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Univ. of Central Florida	Orlando, FL
March 24-25, 1995	AMS Sectional Meeting @ DePaul Univ.	Chicago, IL
May 18, 1995	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
May 19-20, 1995	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
May 19-21, 1995 TENT	ECBT Meeting	??
June 10-15, 1995	SLA Annual Conference	Montreal, Canada
June 23-24, 1995	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
October 5, 1995	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC
October 6-7, 1995	MSEB Board Meeting	Washington, DC
November 3-4, 1995	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Kent State Univ.	Kent, OH
November 17-19, 1995 TENT	ECBT Meeting	Providence, RI
November 18, 1995	MSEB Exec Com Meeting	Washington, DC

C.1 Future Meetings.

23

January 10-13, 1996	AMS-MAA Annual Meeting	Orlando, FL
January 13, 1996	AMS Council	Orlando, FL
January 24-26, 1996	SLA Winter Meeting	Cleveland, OH
March 22-23, 1996	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Univ. of Iowa	Iowa City, IA
April 19-21, 1996	AMS Sectional Meeting @ Louisiana State Univ.	Baton Rouge, LA
May 17-19, 1996 TENT	ECBT Meeting	??

DATE	MEETING	SITE
June 8-13, 1996	SLA Annual Conference	Boston, MA
November 22-24, 1996 TENT	ECBT Meeting	Providence, RI
January 8-11, 1997	AMS-MAA Annual Meeting	San Diego, CA
January 11, 1997	AMS Council	San Diego, CA
May 16-18, 1997 TENT	ECBT Meeting	??
June 7-12, 1997	SLA Annual Conference	Seattle, WA
November 21-23, 1997 TENT	ECBT Meeting	Providence, RI
January 13-16, 1999	AMS-MAA Annual Meeting	San Antonio, TX
January 16, 1999	AMS Council	San Antonio, TX